

# **100 Questions for Sunnis**

## **By Abdul Karim Mushtaq Shaheed**

### **1. Introduction**

These one hundred questions are from the pen of Allamah Abdul Kareem Mushtaq, a name that needs no introduction for Urdu readers. A former Sunni scholar that converted to Shi'a Islam in the late 1960's, he dedicated his entire life to defending the path of truth. Author of over thirty books, the vast bulk of his works were rebuttals to Nasibi texts attacking the Shi'a, and he managed to silence many leading lights of Mu'awiya's cause, such as Dost Muhammad Qurayshi and Qadhi Mazhar Husayn. A continual thorn in the flabby sides of the Nasibi, the inability of the Marwani Mullah's to refute his books, led to them seeking to ban his books through Court on the grounds that they constituted 'disrespect of the Sahaba'. Despite such efforts, he continued his mission undeterred by Nasibi hate mail and death threats. Some of his most notable books include Furu-e-Deen, wherein he presented one thousand questions for the Ahl'ul Sunnah Ulema to refute and Chodha Masalai (replies to 14 questions typically raised against the Shi'a). A great orator as well as a prolific writer thousands of people in Pakistan converted to the path of truth, through him. Unfortunately this fact, coupled with the spectacular inability of the Nasibi to refute his books, made him a direct target, and they silenced him in the only way that followers of Mu'awiya can, by fatally shooting him in Lahore in the mid nineties. Despite this tragedy his memory lives on, his writings continue to act as a huge source of inspiration and guidance for the Shi'a, and the Answering-Ansar.org team have been heavily influenced by his excellent texts. These questions form the second portion of Abdul Kareem Mushtaq's book, Usul-e-Deen. Although we have translated this book, it was felt that these one hundred questions are best placed as a separate document under the challenge section. Whilst the Allamah had cited Urdu editions of books, we changed the text, referring to English editions, to ensure that these references can be located more easily. May Allah (swt) reward Allamah Abdul Kareem Mushtaq for his efforts and grant him Paradise with the Imams (as). May his legacy (his books) continue to act as source of guidance for us all. May Allah (swt) also accept our intention, and bless Prophet Muhammad and his purified family. Illahi Ameen.

### **2. Questions 1 to 10**

The following one hundred questions are presented so that we can ascertain the position of the Ahl'ul Sunnah on these points. It should serve as an opportunity for our Ahl'ul Sunnah brethren, to assess the weight of his adopted beliefs in an impartial manner, free from the shackles of blind prejudice borne out of parental doctrines. Our assertions are that, the Ahl'ul Sunnah Ulema are unable to provide satisfactory responses to any of these questions.

**1.**

It is an established fact that all things are recognised by their name, even Allah (swt) first taught names to the father of Mankind Adam (as). Your sect also has names such as Sunni, Ahl' ul Sunnah or Ahl'ul Sunnah wa al Jamaah. Direct us towards any such verse of the Qur'an wherein any of these names have been indicated.

**2.**

If these titles cannot be located in the Qur'an could you produce this title from any hadith of the holy prophet (s)? Produce any such 'mutawatir' 'marfuu' or 'saheeh' narration from your books with a complete source (meaning the name of the book, version number, page number, edition etc) wherein the names Sunni, Ahlul Sunnah and Ahlul Sunnah wa al Jamaah have been mentioned by the holy prophet (saww) as a sect of Islam.

**3.**

If these are not to be found in the hadeeth, then at least come up with an exact date, month and year of hijrah from the history of Islam when these names were adopted as your identity.

**4.**

What were you famously known as before adopting these names?

**5.**

Why have you forsaken your previous title?

**6.**

According to your sect, an introduction of any new thing to Islam constitutes bid'a, therefore to effectuate such an introduction is also a bid'a, so who was the person responsible for introducing this bid'a?

**7.**

Could you provide decisive evidence with regards to the meanings of Sunni, Ahl Sunnah and Ahlul Sunnah wal Jamaah?

**8.**

Which one is the most ancient of the three titles?

**9.**

Which one of the three titles do you consider the best?

**10.**

Why are the remaining two of lesser merit? Which one of those two is the least and what is the reason behind it?

### **3. Questions 11 to 20**

**11.**

The title 'Shia' is present in the Qur'an and the hadeeth and Hardhat Ibraheem (as) has also been named a Shia. Do you accept this?

**12.**

If you do accept this, then what you do mean by 'Millat e Ibraheem' in your sect? And if you don't accept this then please give us a reason as to why the word Shi'a has been used with reference to Prophet Ibraheem (as)?

**13.**

Does opposition to the title 'Shia' not constitute opposition to the Qur'an and the sayings of the holy prophet (s) when this title has been related to Ali (as), Fatima (as) and the Ahlul Bayt (as)? Please see our article "To know the Shi'a"

**14.**

If it is then what is the punishment for opposing Allah (swt) and His Messenger? If it is not, then present an explicit narration with evidence to support your position?

**15.**

The religion of Islam is established and its continual existence through every generation is a necessity. Hence, during the period of the Sahaba and the Tabe'een what titles were used?

**16.**

Which one of these titles was the oldest? Narrate with evidence.

**17.**

If it is Shi'a that was in use as has been confirmed by Shah Abdul Aziz Muhaddas Dahlavi in Taufa Ithna Ashriyya, then all the Sahabah, Tabi'een and Taba Tabi'een were Shia'a. Does your hatred to a title used by these great personalities not discredit their name?

**18.**

With questions 17 in mind, why do you say that the Shi'a martyred Imam Husayn (as)?

**19.**

What is the definition of Shi'a in your sect? Mention it with a lexical reference.

**20.**

Define Nasibi and Rafidhi in detail with lexical reference.

#### **4. Questions 21 to 30**

**21.**

Do you believe in the 'Tawheed' of Allah (swt)? If you do, then is the essence of Allah (swt) Wajibul Wujood or Mumkinul Wujood? Wajibul Wujood: Belief in: Allah has always been, will always be, has no boundaries or limitations Mumkinul Wujood: Belief in: May be Allah has not always been (in existence), may be He might not be forever and he has boundaries.

**22.**

If Allah (swt) is Wajibul Wujood then what is your belief with regards to Hulool like Maulana Room has written in relation to Bayazeed Bistami: **Baa Mureedaan Aan Fakere Muhtasham, Baayazeed aamad ke yek Yazdaal Manam** Give us a detailed account of it. Hulool: Meaning a belief that God can descend in any living being's body, and so communicate spiritually with the being.

**23.**

Do you regard Allah as Aalam (knowledgeable) or Aleem (possessor of infinite knowledge)? If Aalam, then your greatest book after the Qur'an, "Sahih al Bukhari" Volume 6 hadith number 371: "**The Prophet (saws) said, "The people will be thrown into the (Hell) Fire and it will say: 'Are there any more (to come)? (50:30) till Allah puts his foot over it and it will say 'Qat! Qat!" (Enough! Enough!)**" Sahih Bokhari, Vol. 6, Hadeeth 371 I ask, while creating Hell, did Allah under estimate its size to such an extent that he deemed it necessary to place his leg in to expand it at a later date?

**24.**

Is Allah not the possessor of the power of 'Kun Fayakun (everything)? If He is, then why can't he just limit hell with a simple command?

**25.**

Among your beliefs is the fact that good and evil comes from Allah[swt], mean that Allah[swt] is the source of evil as well (astaghfirullah)? Prove this belief intellectually.

**26.**

You have six Kalimas, the sixth of which is called '**Radde Kufr**' wherein you do tabarra. Like in: **Fatabarra'tu Minal Kufri wash Shirki wal Kidhb.** I disassociate myself from Kufr and Shirk. , ,

Do you regard the doing of tabarra as permissible?

**27.**

If you deem it permissible then why do you object to the Shi'a? And if you consider it forbidden then why not terminate your sixth kalima wherein you disassociate from Kufr? Would it not be better to simply accept that Tabarra is a means of dissociating oneself from Kufr?

**28.**

'Laa tudrukuhul absaar' are Qur'anic words, translate them and clarify the meaning of 'Lan Taraani'.

**29.**

When the holy prophet went on Mi'raj, was he blessed with the sight of Allah (swt)? If he was, provide us with a hadeeth with a complete source and reference wherein the holy prophet describes the appearance of Allah (swt)

**30.**

If Allah was behind the veil and the holy prophet had just heard His voice then why was the holy prophet deprived of seeing the beautiful appearance of Allah (swt)?

## 5. Questions 31 to 40

**31.**

What is the basis of your doctrine of God's visibility, the Qur'an or Hadeeth? If it is the Qur'an, then provide us with the verse and justify the contradiction as God's words are devoid of any contradiction. If it is hadeeth, then present it in relation to the Qur'an.

**32.**

Despite the fact that you do not regard the companions as infallible and accept the notion of them committing sins, you consider it wrong to criticise them due to the respect you afford them. You regard their holiness to be in keeping evil off them, which proves the fact that, for the honour of a respectable and dignified personality it is necessary that he is kept away from sins and treated as immune from defects. This concept is infallibility in all but name. Then what objection do you have in considering the holy prophet as infallible when you consider it a sin to call his companions as sinners and reject the infallibility of the holy prophet himself?

**33.**

To you it is not God that nominates people for the post of Imamah or Khilafah but it is based on the choice of human beings that is why the doctrine of Imamah does not form part of your Islamic doctrine. When Khilafah does not have a religious place to you at all, but you regard it as something outside of the Deen then why do you constantly engage in debates with the Shi'a on this? Is this not a contradiction? Why do you not confine political issues to politics only?

**34.**

If Khilafah or Imamah is a matter of religion then as per the Qur'an, the Sunnah of God does not change. Therefore, beginning with Adam (as) through to the prophet Isa (as), name any prophet after whom one of his companions had been chosen as his vicegerent without gap, depriving the members of that prophet's household of the same right.

**35.**

If none of the prophets preceding the holy prophet had a vicegerent who wasn't from his near of kin then why was the Sunnah of Allah (swt) changed in relation to Rasulullah (s)? Refer us to the verse and a hadith of commentary to prove such a change.

**36.**

The slogans "Naara Takbeer Allahu Akbar, Naara Risaalat Ya Rasoolullah and Naara Hayderi YaAli" have been in practice for centuries but just recently you have introduced a new one "Naara Khilafat Haq Chaar Yaar" which signifies that only those four personalities have the right over the post of Khilafat. Mulla Ali Qari in Sharh Fiqh Akbar, Page 176, considers Yazeed Bin Muawiyah as the sixth Khalifah of the holy prophet. What about the rest of khalifahs of Khilafah? Did the holy prophet not state that there will be twelve khalifahs? Mention their names. Please see our article "Imamate; The perfection of Deen"

**37.**

Our mothers and sisters will proclaim their God is Allah, their apostle the holy Prophet and their Maula, Ali (as) but none of them would dare proclaim 'Our Four Rightful Men' out of modesty considering it as an abuse. Then tell us, is this slogan for men only or for both men and women? Note: The original slogan in Urdu, uses the word "Yaar", which can also be used as "very close friends". In India & Pakistan, therefore women hesitate to use this slogan.

**38.**

It is reported in the traditions that a sword was brought for Ali (as) from heaven, angels came down to earth to assist Hadhrath Fatima (as) in revolving the grinding stones (chakki) in cookery, Ridhwan had appeared in the form of a tailor and brought clothes for Imam Hassan (as) and Imam Hussain (as), could you please refer to any hadeeth wherein even one sock is reported to have been revealed for Abubakr, Umar, Uthman and their like.

**39.**

What is your position regarding the faith of Hadhrath Fatima (sea)?

**40.**

If she was a Mu'menah then is it permissible to obey her or not? When every companion is Adil ( Just ), is following one of them a way of salvation?

## 6. Questions 41 to 50

**41.**

If not then tell us why did the holy prophet say, "**Fatima is a part of me, and he who makes her angry, makes me angry.**" Sahih al Bukhari Volume 5 hadith 61

**42.**

If it is permissible to obey her then it is reported in Saheeh Bukhari that Hadhrath Sayyedah Fatima was displeased with the two shaykhs. She had even instructed (in her will) that they should not participate in her funeral procession. Please see our article "Burning the house of Fatima[sa]"

**43.**

If Hadhrath Fatima's displeasure towards the two shaykhs was not against Islam then why is it important upon the general mass to love them? Allah[swt] deemed His anger and Fatima's to be the same, and Syeda Fatima left the earth angry with the 2 Shaykhs.

**44.**

You are of the opinion that there had been no opposition between Hadhrath Ali (as) and the three companions. Suppose I accept that, but let me tell you, I have a very deep respect and honour for the pure lady Fatima (as) who was part of the flesh of the holy prophet (saww) and she has this esteem to her credit that whenever she appeared in the presence of the holy prophet (saww) he used to stand up as a welcoming gesture of honour to her. Therefore, will following such a respectful personality be a cause of salvation or not? Decide by keeping Bukhari and Muslim before your sight.

**45.**

While departing from this world, did the holy prophet (saww) leave the Qur'an with the ummah or not?

**46.**

If he did then why did the need for the collection of the Qur'an arise? And why were the Ummah kept without the Qur'an till the period of Uthman?

**47.**

If the holy prophet (saww) did not leave the Qur'an with the Ummah prior to his departure then the task of Risallah was not accomplished because the purpose of his arrival was to convey the message of Allah to the ummah. How then is the religion complete?

**48.**

You make a long list of Muslims who compiled the revelations which proves the fact that the holy prophet (saww) had himself been causing the Qur'an being written and preserved it. But to our surprise, after the holy prophet (saww) up until the period of Uthman, people could not get the Qur'an. Could you explain why this gap occurred?

**49.**

You are proud of the memorizers of the Qur'an and even claim the fact that there had been many such people among the companions of the holy prophet. Then, tell us, from among Ali (as), Abubakr, Umar and Uthman who knew the Qur'an by heart? Give your answers with complete sources and refer to your books.

**50.**

If none of the three companions had been Haafidh of the Qur'an then why scoff the Shias despite the presence of many Haafidh among them?

## **7. Questions 51 to 60**

**51.**

In a reliable book of your sect, 'Itteqaan' by Suyuti, vol. 1 page 59, it is narrated that Ali (as) had once told Abubakr that an addition was being made to the Qur'an and that my heart tells me that apart from the salaam, I am not going to wear my robe up until I have collected the Qur'an, to which Abubakr said, you saw the right thing. This report has been received from Akramah who is a reliable leader of the Sunnis and every Sunni accepts this report as correct. Is this not a sufficient proof that after the departure of the holy prophet (saww), according to your sect efforts were made to interpolate the word of Allah (swt) and obviously the doers of that were Muslims themselves? What evidence can you then produce in support of the Qur'an being free from Tahreef (addition)?

**52.**

It is narrated in saheeh Bukhari that the holy prophet used to forget the Qur'an? If the bearer of the book, the prophet himself forgets it then the word's correctness becomes doubtful, which makes the Qur'an unreliable. Does such a narration not create doubts on the status of the Qur'an and Rasul'Allah? If Rasul'Allah (s) can err in relation to the Qur'an then does this not also mean he can forget on the Sunnah as well? When the authenticity of the Qur'an and Sunnah comes into question, how can your sect be the true one? See also: Sunan Abu-Dawud, page 350

**53.**

In your innumerable books of hadeeth, there are various reports that the Qur'an has Tahreef in it. For instance it's mentioned in al Itteqaan that Surah Ahzaab had two hundred verses before and now it has 73 verses. What happened to the rest? If they were abrogated then refer us to those verses that came down to abrogate them? Similarly in Itteqaan, vol. 2, page 25 Abdullah Ibn Umar states that none of you should ever claim to have received the whole Qur'an, rather what remains. The presence of such reports shows that according to your sect the Qur'an has been changed. Can you elaborate?

**54.**

Can the apostle forbid what has been allowed by Allah? Can you reply by relying on a Qur'anic verse?

**55.**

Is anyone from among the ummah authorised to forbid what has been allowed by Allah and His messenger?

**56.**

Allamah Shibli Nu'mani in al Farooq page 217 narrates from Saheeh Muslim that Umar had said that two Mut'a were allowed during the time of the holy prophet but I disallow them from now and these are the Mut'a of Hajj and the Mut'a of Nisaa. On what religious authority did Umar forbid what the apostle and Allah (swt) allowed? Clarify this point.

**57.**

The Qur'an says that '**Qaala Mumin min aale firaun yukassim imaanahu**' a believer from the Aal of Firaun had concealed his belief and hence its shown that the concealment of belief out of fear is not disbelief or abhorrent on the part of a believer. Why then is the Taqiyyah of a Shia abhorrent to you?

**58.**

Saheeh Bukhari, vol. 4, page 123 Egyptian edition reports from Hassan Basri that '**Al taqiyya baaqiyata ila yawmil qiyaamat**', (Taqiyya is permissible until the Day of Judgement). When taqiyyah is proved to be permissible from both the Qur'an and the Hadeeth, why then your sect attacks the Shi'a practice of taqiyyah?

**59.**

Fataawa Qadhi Khan vol. 4, page 821 states, that if a person marries a mahram (mother, sister, daughter, aunt etc.) and has sexual intercourse with them and even admits the fact that he knew while performing the marital rites that it was Haraam for him to do that even then according to Imam Abu Hanifa, he is not subject to any type of Islamic penalty. Can we really adhere to a Sect that issues such a fatwa? Give us a rational reply? Fataawa Qadhi Khan, Page 98 Fataawa Qadhi Khan, Page 821

**60.**

The Qur'an states that '**Laa yamassuhu illal Mutahharun**' No one can touch it save the pure but in Fatmaada Alamgeer vol. 5 page 134 and in Fatwa Siraajiya page 75, it is stated that Surah Fateha can be written with urine (astaghfirullah). Could you justify this claim? Fatawa Siraajiya, Page 75

## **8. Questions 61 to 70**

**61.**

Every chapter of the Qur'an begins with Bismillah but Surah tawbah doesn't begin with it, why?

**62.**

When the start of every Surah of the Qur'an has been made with Bismillah, why then do you not start the Surahs in your salaat with Bismillah?

**63.**

Prove 'Thanaa' Eulogy from the Qur'an.

**64.**

Point out Assalaatu minan nawm to us from the Qur'an if not then at least from an authentic hadeeth.

**65.**

Prove that these words had been used as part of the Adhan during Abu Bakr's period.

**66.**

Prove to us that the prayers of taraweeh had been said in congregation during the time of the holy Prophet[saww] and during the period of Abubakr.

**67.**

You only have nine reports at your disposal as far as praying the salaat by folding your arms is concerned. On the principles of the transmitters of hadeeth, prove their chains as 'Saheeh' correct. And prove all the transmitters as reliable.

**68.**

From the period of Abubakr, present any example or a report to prove that Abubakr said his prayers by folding his arms. If you can, why do the Malikis keep their arms straight while saying their prayers?

**69.**

The Qur'an instructs us to fast till night "**thamar atmou alsiyamar ilaa Al-lail**", and night enters when darkness casts in. Why do you open your fasts early? Why were Umar and Uthman opening their fasts after Maghrib prayers? Nuqaa' Umar, Page 110, Hadeeth 351, by Shah Waliullah Dhelavi

**70.**

You claim that the Shia'a Qur'an contains forty parts, prove its source from the four Shia key books (Kutub Al-'Arba'a).

## **9. Questions 71 to 80**

**71.**

If Mut'a is Haraam, why did Asma Bin Abubakr do it? For evidence, refer to Tafseer Mazhari Qadhi Thanaa Allah , page 577.

**72.**

In Mishkat Shareef, it is reported that when Abubakr and Umar asked the holy Prophet[saww] for his daughter, Lady Fatima[sa]'s hand the Prophet[saww] replied she is too young to marry, is this a correct report?

**73.**

If it is wrong then prove it with full evidence both intellectual and textual.

**74.**

If this is correct then think rationally over the fact that, Umme Kulthum[sa] whose mother was too young to marry these people, marries these same personalities, does this make sense? Please see our article "Nikah of Lady Umme Kulthum[sa]"

**75.**

Can your prayers be complete without darood? If yes then come up with full evidence and if not then how come the blessings are just sent upon Muhammad[saww] and his progeny and not upon his companions and wives? When the prayers can be complete without sending blessings to the wives and the companions, why does Ahl'l Sunnah add the names of these groups to Darood in their religious gatherings?

**76.**

Cite a saheeh and authoritative text hadeeth of the apostle with a complete source wherein it is reported that it is obligatory to send darood upon all the companions and wives of the holy prophet (saww). And also tell us if it is obligatory then how can the prayers be in order without them?

**77.**

You believe that the Khilafat can either be established by public votes or the way of ijma (consensus). Could you verify this with evidence from the sayings of the apostle himself?

**78.**

Did the holy prophet (saww) depart from this world without giving guidance on Khilafat? If yes, why then did the two shaykhs say 'ilaaimatu minal quraysh' (The Imams are from Quraysh) in saqeefa bani sa'da? Did they specifically lie for leadership? Also why oppose the holy prophet's Sunnah, why did Abubakr candidate Umar?

**79.**

In majmaul Bihar, Muhammad Tahir Gujrati writes that Abubakr confessed that 'I am not a Khalifah but a Khalifah' if you regard him truthful then why do you not deny his caliphate?

**80.**

In Sawaiq Al-Muhriqah of Allamah Ibn Hajar Makki writes that there are three siddeeq ( truthful ), Habib an Najaar, Hazqeel and Ali (as), and that Ali (as) was better than the two. Why has Abubakr not been mentioned here? See also: Tafseer e Kabir, Vol 7, Page 317.

**10. Questions 81 to 90**

**81.**

Was Umar the heir of the holy Prophet[saww]'s knowledge? If yes then why as is stipulated by Jalaludeen Suyuti 'Umar used to seek refuge with Allah from every difficult question or case when there is no Abul Hassan (History of the Khalifahs who took the right way (English translation by Abdassamad Clarke page 178)? And why did he confess that '**Iau la Aliyyan lahalakal Umar**'? If Ali (as) wasn't there, Umar would have perished (Tadkhiratul Khawwas, by Sibt Ibne Jauzi, page 127). Note: The comments in Dhikr-e-Hussain by Maulana Kauthar Niyazi are also worthy of note.

**82.**

Did the two shaykhs of Ahl'ul Sunnah participate in the burial rituals of the holy Prophet[saww], if you claim they did, then why do we read that both Sharh mawaqif and Al Farooq Shibli Nu'mani confirm their absence? If they did not participate then what type of friends are these? Al-Farooq, by Shibli Naumani, Page 40

**83.**

In Musnad Ahmed Hanbal and so on, it is mentioned that Ayesha had named Uthman as Nathal, who should be killed and Murtakib Kufr. If you regard Ayesha as the truthful then you will have to accept what she called Uthman. And if she did not tell the truth then why do you call her the truthful? Please see our article "Ayesha"

**84.**

The soldiers that the holy prophet (saww) had prepared against Musailimah ibn kazzab were commanded by Usama and Abubakr and Umar were also instructed to be under him. Why did Abubakr and Umar not go? What legal dispensation did they have that entitled them to ignore the holy Prophet[saww]'s commands? If they have such dispensation, why did the holy Prophet[saww] curse those who were appointed for participation but did not go? See also: Milal wa Al-Nihal [English translation] page 18

**85.**

In Muwatta of Imam malik, translated by Allamah Waheed al Zamaan, Page 147, hadeeth 603, Rasulullah (s) narrates that a companion had approached him, beating his chest and ripping his hair. If chest beating in the presence of Rasulullah (s) is allowed then why do you object to it?

**86.**

Sheikh Abdul Haq Muhaddath Dehlavi in his book Midaaraj Nabaweeya, vol. 2, page 544 writes that the Mu'adhdhin of the apostle, Hadhrath Bilal Habashi (r.a) came to the Mosque of the Prophet[saww] beating his chest and complaining. What is your verdict regarding chest beating?

**87.**

In the Musnad of Imam Hanbal, Egyptian edition, Vol. 6, Page 274 it is written that upon the demise of the holy Prophet[saww], Ayesha beat her chest along with the other women, what is your opinion regarding this act of Ummul Mu'mineen?

**88.**

Hadhrath Ali Hajweeri Al Mash-huur Daata Ganj Bakhsh Lahori in his book Kashful Mahjoob, chapter 2, page 118, section 8 reports it from Umar, that the holy Prophet[saww] played as a camel for the then young Imam Hussain[as], meaning he made himself a replica of a camel. Following the Sunnah of the holy Prophet[saww] is it Sunnah (tradition) to make a replica of Imam Hussain[as]'s horse or is it a bid'at (Innovation)?

**89.**

Kanzul A'mal, Hayder Aabad edition, vol. 5, in the Musnad of Ali karramallahu wajhu, page 147, hadeeth 2403 it is written that, the holy Prophet[saww] used to wipe his feet during wudhoo, why do you not regard wiping as permissible? If the feet will go to hell by being kept dry during wudhoo then how is the wiping over the socks correct?

**90.**

In the Bai'at of Ridhwan, the Muslims took a covenant of not fleeing from the battle field. But the battle of Hunayn took place after the "bay'at of under the tree". Of those people who went against their covenants, what is your verdict with regards to them?

## **11. Questions 91 to 100**

**91.**

The historian, Habib as Sayr writes regarding the battle of Hunayn that: **Purseed Abu Bakr wa Umar kujaa Budand? Guft aan neez dar goshe rafte budand.** Meaning when it was enquired where Abubakr and Umar were?, the narrator replied they had also fled to some corner. Contemplate over this narration, let it be very clear that in your Tafseer Qaweri, Tafseer Hussiani, Rawdhatus Safaa, Taareekhul Khamseen, Rawdhatul Ahbab, Ma'aarijun Nubuwah, etc it is mentioned that the three gentlemen had fled from the battle of Hunayn. Why did they break the covenant of the Bay'at of Ridhwan? Reply after reading all these books.

**92.**

If these three men had been brave then show us from your book Tafseer Qaweri the names of these three men from among those who did not flee in the battle of Hunayn. And prove it to us from all of your books, how many non-believers had been killed by these three men in the battles of Badr, Uhud, Khaybar, Khandaq and Hunayn. How many non-believers did they inflict with harm? And how much harm did themselves sustain in their bodies? And just mention five names with complete sources from among those whom these people killed.

**93.**

If Umar has been brave then write the names of people who got killed at his hands in the battles of Uhud and Hunayn from historical sources compare Ali[sa] and Umar so that their doings in those two battles become known.

**94.**

In the Tafseer of Dur Manthur Suyuti, vol. 54, and Izalatul Khifa of Shah Waliyyullaah Muhammadi Dahlavi, page 199 etc. it is written that the holy Prophet[saww] told Abubakr '**The polytheism is moving in you like the moving of an ant**'. Take notice of this hadeeth and tell us how then was he a siddeeq? And if he did not have shirk within himself then dare to belie like a disbeliever the truthfulness of the holy Prophet[saww].

**95.**

In your Fataawa Qaadhi Khan, vol. 1, page 64, it is written that if a person who is in a state of prayers kisses a woman without lust then his prayer is valid. Is the time for it too short except in prayers? Where is the need for such a thing in prayers?

**96.**

Imam Ghazzali in sirrul Aalameen, Maqaalidul Ba'aa page 9, writes the desire for power had prevailed among the Sahaba and they first turned into opposition. They threw the holy Prophet[saww]'s message onto their backs, they demanded some payment in return for the foundation and they did a very bad trade. Could you please elaborate on this?

**97.**

You oppose the halaal Mut'a and do not hesitate terming it as adultery. But in your book Sharh Wiqaaya, page 298, it is mentioned that to your Imam Abu Hanifa, stated the expenditure of an adulteress is halaal and there is not any jurisprudential limit on one who rewards a woman for zinah. Is Mut'ah worse than this?

**98.**

By calling Marwan back from Medinah, Uthman bin Affan opposed the holy Prophet[saww]. Do you reproach this or support it? Please see our article "Who really killed 'Uthman"

**99.**

It is an established fact in the books of Sunnis that Muawiyah had disputed with the Khalifah Rashid (the rightly guided caliph) and ordered the poisoning of Imam Hassan[sa] (check Mahram Naama, khwaja Hassan Nidhami) and why are the companions who made Ali[as] be abused on the pulpits considered as fair players? Give us intellectual and textual reasoning. Please see our article "Mu'awiya"

**100.**

How and with whose instructions did the incident of Harra transpire? What happened to Medina and Ahl Medinah during the same? Please give a detailed account of it.